

<sup>10</sup>. The following are major writings of these development ethicists: Sabina Alkire, *Valuing Freedoms: Sen's Capability Approach and Poverty Reduction* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002); David A. Crocker, "Toward Development Ethics," *World Development*, 19, 5 (May 1991): 457---83; David A. Crocker and Stephen Schwenke, "The Relevance of Development Ethics for USAID," a Desk Study for United States Agency for International Development, April 2005; and Nigel Dower, *World Ethics – The New Agenda* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1998); Jay Drydyk, "Globalization and Human Rights," in *Global justice, Global Democracy* ed. Jay Drydyk and Peter Penz (Halifax: Fernwood, 1997, 159---83, and "The Development Ethics Framework," in Peter Penz, Jay Drydyk, and Pablo Bose, *Displacement and Development: Ethics and Responsibilities* (unpublished manuscript); Jay Drydyk and Atiya Habeeb Kidwai, "Development-induced Population Displacement," in *The Economics and Politics of Resettlement in India*, ed. Shobhita Jain and Madhu Bala (New Delhi: Pearson Longman, 2006), **XXX**; Stephen L. Esquith, "Complicity in Mass Violence," *Philosophy & Public Policy Quarterly*, 24, 4 (Fall 2004): 28-35; Des Gasper, *The Ethics of Development: From Economism to Human Development* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004; Denis Goulet, *Development Ethics* (London: Zed, 1995) ), and *Development Ethics at Work: Explorations 1960-2002* (London: Routledge, 2006); Daniel Little, *The Paradox of Wealth and Poverty: Mapping the Ethical Dilemmas of Global Development* (Boulder: Westview, 2003; Desmond McNeill, "Equity, Development and the World Bank: Can Ethics Be Put Into Practice?" in *The World Bank Legal Review*, vol. 2, *Law, Equity and Law, Equity and Development*, 419-439, eds. Caroline Mary Sage and Michael Woolcock (Washington, DC: Martinus Nijhoff and World Bank, 2006); *Law, Equity and Development*, 419-439, eds. Caroline Mary Sage and

Michael Woolcock (Washington, DC: Martinus Nijhoff and World Bank, 2006); *Law, Equity and Development*, 419-439, eds. Caroline Mary Sage and Michael Woolcock (Washington, DC: Martinus Nijhoff and World Bank, 2006); *Development*, 419-439, eds. Caroline Mary Sage and Michael Woolcock (Washington, DC: Martinus Nijhoff and World Bank, 2006); Desmond McNeill and Asuncion St. Clair, "Development Ethics and Human Rights as the Basis for Poverty Reduction: The Case of the World Bank," in *The World Bank and Governance: A Decade of Reform and Reaction*, 29---47, ed. Diane Stone and Christopher Wright (London: Routledge, 2006); Desmond McNeill and Asuncion Lera St. Clair, eds., *Global Poverty, Ethics and Human Rights: The Role of Multilateral Organisations* (New York and London: Routledge, 2008);

*Development*, 419---439, eds. Caroline Mary Sage and Michael Woolcock (Washington, DC: Martinus Nijhoff and World Bank, 2006); Desmond McNeill and Asuncion St.

Clair, "Development Ethics and Human Rights as the Basis for Poverty Reduction: The Case of the World Bank," in *The World Bank and Governance: A Decade of Reform and Reaction*, 29---47, eds. Diane Stone and Christopher Wright (New York and London: Routledge, 2006); Onora O'Neill, *Bounds of Justice* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000); and Thomas Pogge, *World Poverty and Human Rights* (Cambridge: Polity, 2002).

<sup>1</sup>1. Osvaldo Guariglia, O. (2001) *Una etica para el siglo. XXI: Etica y derechos humanos en un tiempo posmetafisico*, Buenos Aires: Fondo de Cultura Economica; Bernando Kliksberg, *Más ética, más desarrollo* (Buenos Aires: Temas, 2004); Manfred Max-Neef, *Human Scale Development: Conception, Application, and Further Reflections* (London: Apex Press, 1993); Cristián Parker, "Ética, democracia y desarrollo," in *Ética, democracia y desarrollo humano*, ed. Cristián Parker (Santiago: Lom, 1998); Luis Camacho, *Ciencia y tecnología en el subdesarrollo* (Cartago: Editorial Tecnología de Costa Rica, 1993), *Tecnología para el Desarrollo Humano* (San José, Costa Rica: Editorial Tecnológica, 2005), "Development Ethics," in *The Encyclopedia of Science, Technology, and Ethics*, 4 vols. ed. Carl Mitcham (New York: Macmillan Reference, 2005); Jorge Arturo Chavez, *De la utopía a la política económica: Para una ética de las políticas económicas* (Salamanca: San Esteban, 1999); E. Roy Ramirez, *La Responsabilidad Etica en Ciencia y Tecnologia* (Cartago, Costa Rica: Editorial Tecnológica de Costa Rica, 1987); and Ramón Romero, Ramón Romero, *Identidad nacional en Honduras: Una reflexion filosófica* (Tegucigalpa: Universidad Nacional Autónoma de Honduras, Editorial Universitaria, 1990); Reiko Gotoh, "Understanding Sen's Idea of a Coherent Goal-Rights System in the Light of Political Liberalism," paper given at 4th Conference on the Capability Approach: Enhancing Human Security, University of Pavia, Italy, 5-7 September 2004; Asuncion St. Clair,

“Development Ethics: Open-ended and Inclusive Reflections on Global Development,” in *Poverty, Politics and Development: Interdisciplinary Perspectives*, XXX, ed. Dan Banik (Bergen: Fagbokforlaget, 2006), “Global Poverty: Development Ethics Meets Global Justice,” *Globalizations*, 3 (2006), 1-18; “A Methodologically Pragmatist Approach to Development Ethics,” *Journal of Global Ethics*, 3, 2 (2007): 143---64; Jesús Conill, *Horizontes de economía ética: Aristoteles, Adam Smith, Amartya Sen* (Madrid: Editorial Tecnos, 2004); Adela Cortina, *Por una ética del Consumo: La ciudadanía del consumidor en el mundo global* (Madrid: Taurus, 2002), and “Ética del desarrollo: Un camino hacia la paz,” *Sistema*, 192 (May 2006): 3---17; Emilio Martínez Navarro, *Ética para el desarrollo de los pueblos* (Madrid: Editorial Trotla, 2000); Marta Pedrajas Herrero, “El desarrollo humano en la economía ética de Amartya Sen,” Ph.D. Thesis, Faculty of Philosophy, University of Valencia, 2005; Godfrey Gunatilleke, N. Tiruchelvam, and R. Coomaraswamy, eds., *Ethical Dilemmas of Development in Asia*, (Lexington, Mass.: Lexington Books, 1988); Peter John Opio, “Towards a New Economic Order: Needs, Functioning and Capabilities in Amartya Sen’s Theory” (M.A. thesis, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, 1993);. The “Digital Library” on the Web page on the “Initiative on Social Capital, Ethics, and Development” of the Inter-American Development Bank is a valuable resource of recent work, especially by Latin Americans, in development ethics:

[etika@iadb.org](mailto:etica@iadb.org).

12. (Buenos Aires: Editorial El Ateneo, 2002). Earlier anthologies on ethics and development include *Ethics and Development: On Making Moral Choices in Development Cooperation*, ed. C. J. Hamelink, (Kampfen, Netherlands: Kok, 1997); *El desarrollo humano: Perspectivas y desafíos*, ed. Aldo Ameigeiras (San Miquel, Argentina: Universidad Nacional de General Sarmiento, 1998); and *Ética, democracia y*

*desarrollo humano*, ed. Cristián Parker G. (Santiago, Chile: Lom, 1998). An urgent need exists for an English-language collection of historically important and recent articles in development ethics.

<sup>13</sup>. Boulder: Westview, 2003.

14. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004. See also, David Clark, *Visions of Development – A Study of Human Values* (Cheltenham: Edward Elgar, 2002). The Clark volume is a revised Ph.D. thesis and case study rather than a text book.

<sup>15</sup>. The groups' respective websites are (1) the International Development Ethics Association (<http://www.development-ethics.org/>); (2) the Inter-American Initiative on Social Capital, Ethics and Development (<http://www.iadb.org/etica/ingles>); and (3) the Human Development and Capability Association (<http://www.fas.harvard.edu/~freedoms>). Although not explicitly dedicated to development ethics, other associations—such as the Society for International Development, the United Nations Association, and the World Development Movement—have had serious ethical interests related to development and foreign aid.

<sup>16</sup>. University of Aberdeen (Scotland), Carleton University (Canada), Colorado State University (USA), Institute of Social Studies (the Netherlands), Michigan State University (USA), Makerere University (Uganda), New School University (USA), Stellenbosch University (South Africa), Uganda Martyrs University (Uganda), University of Bergen (Norway), Universidad de Costa Rica, University of Maryland (USA), Universidad de Murcia (Spain), Universidad Nacional Autónoma de Honduras, Universidad Nacional Heredia (Costa Rica), University of Notre Dame (USA), University of Oslo (Norway), Universidad de Santiago (Chile), University of Valencia

(Spain).

<sup>17</sup>. Richard M. Clugston and John A. Hoyt, "Environment, Development and Moral Values," *Ethics and Development: On Making Moral Choices in Development Cooperation*, ed. C. J. Hamelink, 82---103.

<sup>18</sup>. Arturo Escobar, *Encountering Development: The Making and Unmaking of the Third World* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1995).

19. For a sample of such moral dilemmas in development practice and cooperation, see David A. Crocker, "Toward Development Ethics" 461---64; *Ethics and Development: On Making Moral Choices in Development Cooperation*, ed. C. J. Hamelink; and Gasper, *Ethics of Development*.

<sup>20</sup>. Although anti-corruption strategies sometimes encompass the objectives of poverty reduction and participatory democracy, a focus on controlling corruption often eclipses these larger development goals and becomes the only end considered. See, for example, Moisés Naim, "Bad Medicine," *Foreign Policy*, March/April 2005, 95-96.

<sup>21</sup>. See Nicholas D. Kristof, "When Marriage Kills," *New York Times*, March 30, 2005, A 27.

<sup>22</sup>. Carol Graham and Stefano Pettinato, *Happiness & Hardship: Opportunity and Insecurity in New Market Economies* (Washington, D. C.: Brookings Institution Press, 2002); John Rawls, *A Theory of Justice*, Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1971; rev. ed, 1997); John Roemer, *Theories of Distributive Justice* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1996); Johann Galtung, "The New International Order and the Basic Needs Approach," *Alternatives*, 4 (1978/9), 455---76; Manfred Max-Neef, *Human Scale Development: Conception, Application, and Further*

*Reflections* (London: Apex Press, 1993); Paul Streeten with S. J. Burki, S.J., Mahbub ul Haq, Norman Hicks, and Frances Stewart, *First Things First: Meeting Basic Needs in Developing Countries* (London: Oxford University Press, 1981); Len Doyal and Ian Gough, *A Theory of Need* (London: Macmillan, 1991); Des Gasper, *The Ethics of Development*, chap. 6; P. T. Bauer, *Dissent on Development* (London: Weidenfeld & Nickolson, 1971); Robert Nozick, *Anarchy, State and Utopia* (New York: Basic Books, 1974); Amartya Sen, *Development as Freedom* (New York: Knopf, 1999), Onora O'Neill, *Bounds of Justice*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000); David Ellerman, *Helping People Help Themselves: From the World Bank to an Alternative Philosophy of Development Assistance*, Foreword by Albert O. Hirschman (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2005); Martha Nussbaum, *Women and Human Development: The Capabilities Approach* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000); Thomas W. Pogge, *World Poverty and Human Rights* (Cambridge, U.K.: Polity Press, 2002), and "Can the Capability Approach Be Justified," *Philosophical Topics*, 30, 2 (Fall 2002): 167---228; Amartya Sen, "Elements of a Theory of Human Rights," *Philosophy & Public Affairs*, 32, 4 (2004): 315---56. Polly Vizard, *Poverty and Human Rights: Sen's 'Capability Perspective' Explored* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006); Bas de Gaay Fortman, "Human Rights," in *Elgar Companion*, ed. Clark, 260---66.

<sup>23</sup> Thomas Nagel argues that duties of socioeconomic justice are the exclusive concern of sovereign states (and their citizens) in relation to their own (fellow) citizens. In relation to citizens of other countries, a sovereign state only has negative duties not to enslave, coerce, or violate civil liberties as well as the positive duties of humanitarian

assistance and rescue. See Thomas Nagel, “The Problem of Global Justice,” *Philosophy & Public Affairs*, 33, 2 (2005).

<sup>24</sup> Pogge, *World Poverty and Human Rights*, 2. Cf. Thomas Nagel, “The Problem of Global Justice,” *Philosophy & Public Affairs*, 33, 2 (2005), 118. The first paragraph of the United Nations Development Programme’s *Human Development Report 2005* drives home a similar point but without Pogge’s important reminder of global disparities:

The tsunami was a highly visible, unpredictable and largely unpreventable tragedy. Other tragedies are less visible, monotonously predictable and readily preventable. Every hour more than 1,200 die away from the glare of media attention. This is equivalent to three tsunamis a month, every month, hitting the world’s most vulnerable citizens—its children. The causes of death vary, but the overwhelming majority can be traced to a single pathology: poverty. Unlike the tsunami, that pathology is preventable. With today’s technology, financial resources and accumulated knowledge, the world has the capacity to overcome extreme deprivation. Yet as an international community we allow poverty to destroy lives on a scale that dwarfs the impact of the tsunami (United Nations Development Programme, *Human Development Report 2005* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005).

<sup>25</sup> Des Gasper is particularly eloquent in articulating the widely shared assumption that development agents face alternative paths and that development ethics emphasizes “value-conscious ways of thinking about and choosing between alternative



paths and destinations” (Gasper, *The Ethics of Development*, xi).

<sup>26</sup> United Nations Development Programme, *Human Development Report* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990-2004). These *Human Development Reports* operationalize the capability approach and address such themes as consumption, globalization, human rights, technology, democracy, the Millennium Development Goals, and cultural identity. See *Readings in Human Development: Concepts, Measures and Policies for a Development Paradigm*, eds. Sakiko Fukuda-Parr and A. K. Shiva (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003); Asunción Lera St. Clair, “The Role of Ideas in the United Nations Development Programme,” *Global Institutions and Development: Framing the World?* eds. Morten Bøås and Desmond McNeill (London: Routledge, 2004), 178---92; Mozaffar Qizilbash, “Human Development,” in *Elgar Companion*, ed. Clark, 245---50; Amartya K. Sen, “Human Development Index,” in *Elgar Companion*, ed. Clark, 256---60.

27. Amartya Sen and Jean Dréze, *Hunger and Public Action* (Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 1989).

28. Sen, *Development as Freedom*, 21.

29. See Martha Nussbaum and Jonathan Glover, eds., *Women, Culture and Development: A Study of Human Capabilities* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995).

<sup>30</sup> Amartya Sen, “Elements of a Theory of Human Rights,” *Philosophy & Public Affairs*, 32, 4 (2004), 333, n. 31.

31. World Bank, *World Development Report 2006: Equity and Development* (New York: World Bank and Oxford University Press, 2005), 3.

<sup>32</sup> Ibid., 2.

33. The authors of *World Development Report 2006*, appealing to a narrow construal of the World Bank's mandate and comparative advantage, shy away from arguing for (any concept of) equity as intrinsically good or for any political design as normatively required. See, for example, *Ibid.*, 10, 20, and 206.

<sup>34</sup>. Michael Sandel, *Liberalism and the Limits of Justice* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982).

<sup>35</sup>. Holmes Rolston III, "Feeding People Versus Saving Nature?" in *World Hunger and Morality*, 2d. ed., ed. Aiken and LaFollette, 248---66.

<sup>36</sup>. Stiglitz, *Globalization and Its Discontents* (New York: W. W. Norton, 2002), 218---19.

37. Sen, *Development as Freedom*, 53.

38. Charles R. Beitz, "Does Global Inequality Matter?" *Global Justice*, ed. Thomas W. Pogge (Oxford: Blackwell, 2001), 113. See World Bank, *World Development Report 2006*, 206---207.

39. Pogge, *World Poverty*, 15, 21, 112---16, 141---45.

40. *Ibid.*, 143.

<sup>41</sup>. In 2006 Pogge formulated a more balanced view of both global and national factors in causing and remedying human rights deprivations ("Severe Poverty: Harm Done Through Social Institutions," keynote address, 7<sup>th</sup> International Conference on Ethics and Development, International Development Ethics Association, Kampala, Uganda, 19-22 July 2006). He anticipated this more complex view in *World Poverty*, 50.

42. Onora O'Neill, "Agents of Justice," in *Global Justice*, ed. Thomas W. Pogge (Oxford: Blackwell, 2001), 188---203.

<sup>43</sup>. Joseph E. Stiglitz, *The Roaring Nineties: A New History of the World's Most Prosperous Decade* (New York: W. W. Norton, 2003), xii.

44. See, for example, Martha Nussbaum, *Women and Human Development*; "Capabilities and Disabilities: Justice for Mentally Disabled Citizens," *Philosophical Topics*, 30, 2 (2002): 133---65; *Frontiers of Justice: Disability, Nationality, Species Membership*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2005; David A. Crocker, "Ética del desarrollo y grupos vulnerables," Keynote address, Congreso internacional cooperación al Desarrollo: "Cooperacion y Grupos Vulnerables," 17-19 November 2005.

<sup>44</sup>. In addition to the Rolston and Clugston and Hoyt articles cited above, see, *Ethics of Environment and Development: Global Challenge and International Response*, eds. J. Ron Engel and Joan Hoff Engel (London: Belhaven Press; Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1990); Robin Attfield, *The Ethics of the Global Environment* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1999); *Global Sustainable Development in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, eds. Keekok. Lee, A. Holland, and Desmond McNeill (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2000); Peter J. Balint, "Balancing Conservation and Development: Two Cases Studies from El Salvador," Ph.D. Dissertation, School of Public Affairs, University of Maryland, December 2000; Partha Dasgupta, *Human Well-being and the Natural Environment* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001); Amartya Sen, *Rationality and Freedom* (Cambridge, MA and London: Belknap, Harvard University Press, 2002), chap. 18; Nigel Dower, "The Nature and Scope of Global Ethics and the Relevance of the Earth Charter," *Journal of Global Ethics*, 1, 1 (June 2005): 25---43.

45. Peter Singer, *One World: The Ethics of Globalization* 2<sup>nd</sup>. ed. (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2004), especially, chaps. 2 and 3; Adela Cortina, *Por una*

*ética del consumo* (Madrid: Taurus, 2002).

46. For my writings and those of other scholars on reckoning with past wrongs, see my “Punishment, Reconciliation, and Democratic Deliberation,” *Buffalo Criminal Law Review*, 5, 2 (2002): 509---549, especially n. 9 and n. 87; “Interpretative Ideals and Truth Commissions: Comments on Krausz’s “The Limits of Rightness,” *Interpretation and its Objects: Studies in the Philosophy of Michael Krausz*, Andreea D. Ritivoi and Giridhari L. Pandit (Amsterdam: Rodopi Publishers, 2003), 55-68; “Reckoning with Past Wrongs in East Asia,” a paper presented to the workshop “Memory, Reconciliation and Security in the Asia-Pacific Region: Implications for Japan-US Relations,” Hyogo, Japan, 15-17 December 2006.

47. United Nations Development Programme, *Human Development Report 1994* (Oxford University Press, 1994).

48. Commission on Human Security, *Human Security Now: Protecting and Empowering People* (New York: Communications Development, 2003). See also Nigel Dower, “Development, Violence, and Peace: A Conceptual Exploration,” *European Journal of Development Research*, 11, 2 (1999): 44---64; Des Gasper, “Violence and Human Security,” *The Ethics of Development*, chap. 5; “Securing Humanity: Situating ‘Human Security’ as Concept and Discourse,” *Journal of Human Development: Alternative Economics in Action*, 6, 2 (July 2005): 221---45; United Nations Development Programme, *Human Development Report 2005: International Cooperation at a Crossroads: Aid, Trade and Security in an Unequal World* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2005), chap.5; Selim Jahan, “Human Security,” in *Elgar Companion*, ed. Clark, 266---71.

49. Allan Thompson, “Arbour Ready for U.N. Role,” *Toronto Star*, 7 June 2004, A 20.

50. See Lloyd Dumas, “Is Development an Effective Way to fight Terrorism?” *Institute for Philosophy & Public Policy Quarterly*, 22, 4 (2002): 7---12. Whether development that reduces poverty also reduces humiliation depends on whether poverty is more than lack of income and whether a distinction is made between well-being (ill-being) and agency or empowerment (lack of agency). I owe this point to Des Gasper.

<sup>51</sup>. See, for example, Joseph E. Stiglitz and Andrew Charlton, *Free Trade for All: How Trade Can Promote Development* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005); United Nations Development Programme, *Human Development Report 2005*, chap. 4.

52. See Celia W. Dugger, “An Exodus of African Nurses Puts Infants and the Ill in Peril,” *New York Times*, 12 July 2004, A1, A8 for a shocking account of hospital conditions in Malawi and the fact that wretchedly poor pay are causing many nurses—seeking a better life for themselves and their families—to emigrate to Great Britain and elsewhere.

53. For Bernstein’s writings on Dewey, ethics, and social-political philosophy, see chap. 1, n. 64.

54. Sabina Alkire made this point in the training session “The Capability Approach as a Development Paradigm,” 3<sup>rd</sup> Conference on the Capability Approach,” Pavia, Italy, September, 7-9, 2003.

55. See above, p. 4.

56. For a response to what he calls “economism,” see Gasper, *The Ethics of Development*, especially chap. 3. Stephen Schwenke and Ada Pizze of the Inter-American Development Bank’s “Initiative for Social Capital, Ethics, and Development,” persistently criticize development ethics for failing to deal with the moral issues of

practitioners in the development trenches. For arguments that the concept of poverty, the ideal of participation, and the practice of development and development ethics are tools of Western imperialism, see *The Development Dictionary*, ed. Wolfgang Sachs (London: Zed, 1992).

57. Sympathetic and largely constructive critics include Jesús Conill, “Capacidades humanas,” *Glosario para una sociedad intercultural*, ed. Jesús Conill (Valencia: Bancaja, 2002), 29---34; *Horizontes de economía ética: Aristoteles, Adam Smith, Amartya Sen* (Madrid: Editorial Tecnos, 2004); Adela Cortina, *Por una etica del consumo*; and Phillip Pettit, “Capability: A Defence of Sen,” *Economics and Philosophy*, 17 (2001): 1---20. In Chapter 7 not only do I accept much of Cortina’s criticisms of my earlier prudential version of the capability orientation, but I improve my earlier view by modifying it in the light of her Kantian consumption ethic. Sen accepts the thrust of some (but only some) of Pettit’s alternatives in “Reply,” *Economics and Philosophy*, 17 (2001): 51---56. Other recent critics are less supportive. They include Robert Sugden, “Welfare, Resources and Capabilities: A Review of *Inequality Reexamined* by Amartya Sen,” *Journal of Economic Literature*, 31 (1993): 947---62; Richard J. Arneson, “Equality and Equal Opportunity for Welfare,” *Philosophical Studies*, 56 (1989): 77---93, and “Perfectionism and Politics,” *Ethics*, 111, 1 (2000): 37--63, John Roemer, *Theories of Distributive Justice* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1996). For assessments of Nussbaum, see essays by Louise M. Antony, Arneson (referred to above), Hilary Charlesworth, and Richard Mulgan in “Symposium on Martha Nussbaum’s Political Philosophy” *Ethics*, 111, 1 (2000). Nussbaum responds to these four assessments in “Aristotle, Politics, and Human Capabilities: A Response to Antony,

Arneson, Charelsworth, and Mulgan,” *Ethics*, 111, 1 (2000): 102---40. Three collections include important evaluations of both Sen’s and Nussbaum’s work on the capability orientation: *Women, Culture and Development: A Study of Human Capabilities*, eds. Martha C. Nussbaum and Jonathan Glover (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1995) and *Feminist Economics*, 9, 2-3 (2003); *Capabilities Equality: Basic Issues and Problems*, ed. Alexander Kaufman (New York: Routledge, 2006).

59. See *Feminist Economics*, 9, 2-3 (2003).

60. See Thomas C. Pogge, “Can the Capability Approach Be Justified,” *Philosophical Topics*, 30, 2 (Fall 2002): 167---228.

61. I thank Ingrid Robyns for discussions bearing on this paragraph.

62. Several authors utilize one or the other and often both of these strategies. See Séverine Deneulin, “Perfectionism, Paternalism and Liberalism in Sen and Nussbaum’s Capability Approach,” *Review of Political Economy*, 14, 4 (2002): 497---518; Des Gasper, “Development as Freedom: Moving Economics beyond Commodities – the Cautious Boldness of Amartya Sen,” *Journal of International Development*, 12, 7 (2000): 989---1001; “Is Sen’s Capability Approach an Adequate Basis for Considering Human Development?” *Review of Political Economy*, 14, 4 (2002): 435---61; “Nussbaum’s Capabilities Approach in Perspective – Purposes, Methods and Sources for an Ethics of Human Development,” Working Paper (The Hague: Institute of Social Studies, 2003); Mozaffar Quizilbash, “Development, Common Foes, and Shared Values,” *Review of Political Economy*, 14, 4 (2002): 463---80. Most of the articles in *Feminist Economics*, 9, 2-3 (2003) freshly assess Sen’s work “through the lens of gender” and seek to mediate differences between Sen and Nussbaum. Especially

important is Ingrid Robeyns, “Sen’s Capability Approach and Gender Inequality: Selecting Relevant Capabilities,” *Feminist Economics*, 9, 2-3 (2003): 61---92 in which Robeyns argues against one and only one list and argues for specific lists for particular purposes and contexts. See, also, Sabina Alkire, *Valuing Freedoms: Sen’s Capability Approach and Poverty Reduction* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002); and “Public Debate and Value Constuction in Sen’s Approach,” in *Capabilities Equality*, ed. Kaufman. Although closer to Sen than to Nussbaum, Alkire argues for some uses of lists. She also draws creatively on some ideas of John Finnis, a theorist outside the capability orientation.

63. The variety of democratic theory known as “deliberative democracy” also is in danger of becoming a new scholasticism. One way to guard against this threat, which I will refer to and employ in Chapters 9 and 10, is to bring the theory of deliberative democracy into critical dialogue with other democratic theories and with institutional experiments in deliberative democracy.

64. My views in this paragraph owe much to discussions with Ingrid Robeyns. See Ingrid Robeyns, “The Capability Approach — A Theoretical Survey,” *Journal of Human Development: Alternative Economics in Action*, 6, 1 (2005): 93---114. See also, Sabina Alkire, “Why the Capability Approach,” *Journal of Human Development: Alternative Economics in Action*, 6, 1 (2005): 115---133.

<sup>65</sup>. James D. Wolfensohn and Amartya Sen, “Development: A Coin with Two Sides,” *International Herald Tribune*, 5 May 1999.

<sup>66</sup>. <http://www.iadb.org/etica/ingles>

<sup>67</sup>. <http://www1.worldbank.org/publicsector/anticorrupt/LeadershipEthics/bbags.c>



fm?offset=5

68. See, for example, *Global Institutions and Development: Framing the World?* eds. Morten Bøås and Desmond McNeill (London and New York: Routledge, 2003). .

69. See Stephen Gould Schwenke, “Morality and Motivation: A Role for a Human Rights Approach in the World Bank’s Urban Strategy? Ph.D. Dissertation, School of Public Policy, University of Maryland, 2002; David A. Crocker and Stephen Schwenke, “The Relevance of Development Ethics for USAID,” a Desk Study for United States Agency for International Development, April 2005.