

---

**SCHOOL OF PUBLIC POLICY, UNIVERSITY OF MARYLAND  
MARYLAND LEADERSHIP INSTITUTE, SUMMER 2006**

**POLICY SEMINAR 1: Ethics, Development, and Foreign Aid**

---

David A. Crocker, Professor Van Munching Hall, 3111G Institute for Philosophy and Public Policy School of Public Policy University of Maryland <a href="mailto:dcrocker@umd.edu">dcrocker@umd.edu</a> Phones: 301-405-4763 (office) 240-678-6267 (cell) Fax: 301-314-9346	Martha Haile, Grad. Teaching Assistant Van Munching Hall, 1113 School of Public Policy University of Maryland <a href="mailto:martha.haile@gmail.com">martha.haile@gmail.com</a> Phone: 585-576-4886 301-405-6361 (community lounge)
---	--

**Course Webpage:**

[www.wam.umd.edu/~dcrocker/Courses/MLI2006PS1.html](http://www.wam.umd.edu/~dcrocker/Courses/MLI2006PS1.html)

**Session Timings:**

9 a.m.-12 noon, Tuesdays, June 13 and 20; Thursdays, June 15 and 22; Monday, June 26; Wednesday, June 28 (Possible Site visit to the Inter-American Development Bank or the World Bank)

**Class room:** Van Munching 1203

**Office hours DC:** Van Munching 3111G, Before each class 8:00-9:00 a.m. Also Mondays, Wednesdays, and Fridays 5:15-6:30 p.m.(except June 2-5, July 14-26) and other times by appointment.

**Office hours MH:** After class, 12-1 in Community Lounge. Other times by appointment.

**I. Aims of the Course:**

This course examines the empirical, conceptual, and ethical dimensions of local, national, and international development policies. It will focus on the demands for distributive justice and democracy -- how relevant these ideals are for developing countries, how they might be effectively implemented, and what leadership styles are most appropriate in different contexts. Specifically, students will analyze the present character of development in poor countries/regions and determine how development should be conceived, what development strategies are best and what should be the ends and means of U.S. and global foreign aid and development assistance.

These general issues will be addressed in relation to economic and political challenges confronting Ecuador, especially its native peoples such as the Huaorani.

Among Ecuador's problems, arguably, are national indebtedness, poor balance of payments, environmental destruction (often caused by international oil companies), poverty and ill health, violence (ethnic conflict and drug-trafficking), a shallow democracy, problematic leadership, and the loss cultural traditions. The course will employ Joe Kane's *Savages* as a case study and supplement the book with more recent web and other materials on Ecuador, the Ecuadorian Amazon, and the Huaorani tribe.

The climax of the course will be a simulation of an "asamblea" in the Huaorani territory. Students will take on the roles of representatives of major stakeholders (the Huaorani, other tribes, national and international NGOs, the Ecuadorian government, multinational oil companies, USAID, and IADB) and together deliberate on what are the best development policies for Ecuadorian Amazon. Each student will also write a policy memo (in her own voice) analyzing and evaluating the competing options for the region and recommending one option as best.

## II. Required Books

- Joe Kane, *Savages*, 2nd . Ed, (New York: Vintage 1996)
- Amartya Sen, *Development as Freedom* (Harvard University Press, 1999).
- Selected handouts and items on class website

## III. Grading

Daily participation	33.33%
Policy memo (with option to revise)	33.33%
Huaorani asamblea (presentation and discussion)	33.33%

## IV. Course Outline

- Consider on your three preferences for a role in the Asamblea, June 28 (See Asamblea Instructions)

### ***Session I (Tuesday, June 13): What is the Ethics of Development? Ethical Issues in Ecuadorian and Indigenous Development***

#### **Readings:**

- David A. Crocker, "Ethics of Global Development: Agency, Capability, and Deliberative Democracy," *Philosophy & Public Policy Quarterly*, 22, 4 (Fall 2002): 21-27. Hand-out, Class website and [www.puaf.umd.edu/IPPP/Quarterly](http://www.puaf.umd.edu/IPPP/Quarterly).
- Instructors announce roles and teams for Huaorani Asamblea (June 28) and Final Presentations (July 26-27)
- David A. Crocker, "Development Ethics and Globalization," *Philosophy & Public Policy Quarterly*, 22, 4 (Fall 2002): 13-21. Hand out, class website and [www.puaf.umd.edu/IPPP/Quarterly](http://www.puaf.umd.edu/IPPP/Quarterly).
- Sen, *Development as Freedom*, Preface, Introduction
- Kenyan Pictorial Summary of *Development as Freedom*, Introduction (class website)
- Joe Kane, *Savages*, pp. 3-161

#### **Discussion:**

- What ethical and policy issues does *Savages* raise about Ecuadorian and indigenous development?
- Development ethics and development theory-practice

**Session II (Thursday, June 15): The Challenge of Indigenous Development in Latin America. Views of the Huaorani and their Options:**

**Tasks:**

- By class time, email your four preferences for roles in the Asamblea to take place Wednesday, June 28 (For instructions and cast of characters, see syllabus VI. Huaorani Asamblea). Teams will be announced Friday, June 16.

**Readings:**

- Joe Kane, *Savages*, pp. 165-255, Epilogue to Vintage Edition (1996), *Savages Update* (2001?), Joe Kane Correspondence (1) (2001)
- Sen, *Development as Freedom*, ch. 1
- Kenyan Pictorial Summary of *Development as Freedom*, ch. 1 (class website)
- Organization of American States, “*Report on the Situation on the Human Rights in Ecuador*,” Introduction and Chapter IX
- Rodolfo Stavenhagen, “Indigenous Peoples: An Essay on Land, Territory, Autonomy, and Self-determination,” Class website and [www.landaction.org/display.php?article=327](http://www.landaction.org/display.php?article=327) (A longer version is available at [hdr.undp.org/docs/publications/background-papers/2004](http://hdr.undp.org/docs/publications/background-papers/2004))
- Websites or material from next section.

**Views of the Huaorani Development:**

- The Government View and Company Views (find web sites for Government of Ecuador and Petrobras or Reposal)
- The Conservative Missionary View. Video: “Beyond the Gates of Splendor”
- The Radical View. Video: “Trinkets and Beads” and Joe Kane
- The Human Rights View: Organization of American States
- The Environmentalist/Ecotourist view: [www.waorani.com/tademo](http://www.waorani.com/tademo), [www.tropiceco.com/journeys/huaorani-community-tour](http://www.tropiceco.com/journeys/huaorani-community-tour), [www.globaladrenaline.com/latinamerica/ecuador/trip2](http://www.globaladrenaline.com/latinamerica/ecuador/trip2)
- US Congress view: [www.saveamericasforests.org/yasuni/news/articles/7-6-05.US CongressLetter](http://www.saveamericasforests.org/yasuni/news/articles/7-6-05.US%20CongressLetter)
- The Huaorani view: [www.saveamericasforests.org/yasuni/indigenous/documents/index](http://www.saveamericasforests.org/yasuni/indigenous/documents/index), [www.onhae.org](http://www.onhae.org)
- Huaorani women’s view: (AMWAE) [www.saveamericasforests.org/Yasuni/Indigenous/AMWAE/index](http://www.saveamericasforests.org/Yasuni/Indigenous/AMWAE/index)

**Discussion:**

- Compare, contrast, the two films and documents with respect to their diagnosis of and remedy for the Huaorani’s problems.
- What do you think are the feasible and ethically best options for the Huaorani, other indigenous Ecuadorian, and Ecuador?

**Session III (Tuesday, June 20): International Development Assistance for the Huaorani? If so, what kind?**

**Readings:**

- Sen, chapter 2
- David A. Crocker, “Cross Cultural Communication and Development Ethics,” (web site) plus addendum
- Kenyan Pictorial Summary of *Development as Freedom*, Chapter 2 (class website)
- Pro-aid: *United Nations Development Programme, Human Development Report 2005: International Cooperation at a Crossroads: Aid, Trade, and Security in an Unequal World*, pp. 1-9, 75-83
- Anti-aid: Either Sen on Easterly “The Man Without a Plan” in *Foreign Affairs*, March/April 2006, pp. 171-78 (class website)
- World Bank
  1. Issue Brief: “The World Bank and Indigenous Peoples” (class website)
  2. World Bank, “Indigenous Peoples,” Operational Policy OP 4.10 (class website)
  3. World Bank, “Indigenous Peoples,” Bank Procedures BP 4.10 (class website)
- Inter-American Development Bank
  1. “Operational Policy on Indigenous Peoples.” (class website)
- USAID
  1. [www.usaid.gov/locations/latin\\_america\\_caribbean/country/Ecuador](http://www.usaid.gov/locations/latin_america_caribbean/country/Ecuador)
  2. [www.usaid.ec/portal](http://www.usaid.ec/portal)
  3. [www.cia.gov/cia/publications/factbook/geus/ec.html](http://www.cia.gov/cia/publications/factbook/geus/ec.html)

**Discussion:**

- Describe and assess development frameworks have been implemented in Ecuador and its Oriente?
- Identify and evaluate what development options are open to the Huaorani and other indigenous peoples.
- What should the Huaorani do by themselves or with other groups?
- What should the Ecuadorian government do?
- What should the World Bank, IADB, USAID do?

**Session IV (Thursday, June 22): Poverty, Inequality, Justice, and Human Rights**

**Readings:**

- Sen, chapters 3 (pp. 54-67, 70-81, 85-8), 4, 5 (pp. 142-45), 10
- Kenyan Pictorial Summary of *Development as Freedom*, chs. 3, 4, 5, 10 (class website)
- Browse CIA or USAID websites for Ecuador Country facts or profile.

**Presentation:**

- Soumya Chattopadhyay, “A Macro Perspective on Ecuador and Its Indigenous Peoples”

**Discussion:**

- “Have the Huaorani been treated justly by the oil companies and the Ecuadorian government?” “What do justice and human rights require in the Ecuadorian Amazon?”
- How Should We Understand Equitable, Just, and Rights-based Development?
- What are the macro economic and human indicators for Ecuador as a whole and the indigenous peoples in particular?

***Session V (Monday, June 26): Participation, Democracy, and Development***

**Readings:**

- Sen, Chapters 6, 7 (pp. 189-92), 11 (pp. 249-54, 279-81), 12 (pp. 282-92)
- Kenyan Pictorial Summary of Development as Freedom, 6, 7, 11, 12 (class website)
- David A. Crocker, “Deliberative Participation in Local Development,” Ch. 12 of “The Ethics of Global Development: Agency, Capability, and Deliberative Democracy.”(forthcoming)
- Gianpaolo Baiocchi, Boston Review article

**Discussion:**

- Should “Deliberative Participation” be institutionalized among all stakeholders in the Ecuadorian Amazon?
- Should democracy and citizen participation be among the ends and means of good development?

**Initial Policy Memo Due (Monday, June 26), 8:00 a.m. (Send electronic copy to DC, MH, and MP)**

***Session VI (Wednesday, June 28): What Should be Done in the Ecuadorian Amazon and Who Should Do It?***

- Asamblea
- Graded initial policy memos returned electronically by 5:00, Friday, June 30

**Revised Policy I Memos Due:** 5:00 p.m., Sunday, July 2

**Graded Revised Memos Returned:** 5:00 p.m., Sunday, July 9, 5:00 p.m..

## V. Policy Memo

1. **Who does the memo and in what voice?** *Each* student will write a memo in their own voice (with the option of revision) on the following question: “What should be done (to bring about good development) in the Ecuadorian Amazon, who should do it, and how?” You may cast yourself either as an “insider” to the group (but being asked to give your own views) or an “outsider” asked to give an independent assessment. (For advantages and disadvantages of both “insiders” and outsiders see D. Crocker, “Cross-cultural Communication and Development Ethics.” (class web site))
2. Decide on the **recipient or “client”** of your memo, for example, one of the Ecuadorian indigenous organizations, such as the Organization of the Huaorani Nation of the Ecuadorian Amazon (ONHAE), the Confederation of the Indigenous Nationalities of Ecuador (CONAIE), or the Amazonian Indian Confederation (CONFENIE); the President of Ecuador; Ecuador’s Ministry of Indigenous Affairs; the Inter-American Development Bank (IADB), the World Bank (WB); the US Agency for International Development (USAID), the Organization of American States (OAS); an international NGO working in Ecuador, e.g., Save America’s Forests.
3. A template? Follow (or adapt) the template of your memo instructor. Typically good memos have the following components:
  - Summarize your recommendation
  - Set the stage. What is the problem? How did it come about?
  - Set forth criteria a good solution should satisfy. These criteria can and often should include ethical criteria, such as respect for human rights or fairness.
  - Describe two or more competing and (more or less) exclusive options (maintaining the status quo can be one option)
  - Evaluate strengths and weaknesses of each option (by referring back to your criteria)
  - Recommend one option as best (because it best satisfies your criteria) and (optional) next steps to be taken.
4. Format? Memos should be no more than three pages (single spaced, 12 point Times Roman font, one inch margins).
5. Comply with additional “dos” and “don’ts” provided by your memo instructor, Michele Perez.
6. Initial versus revised memo? The initial memo should not be viewed as a rough draft. Although you will have the option to revise the initial memo, you will be graded on it, and you may find you do not have time to revise it or that you have done so well that you do not need to revise it. Hence, do as well as you can on the initial memo. You will have the option to revise the initial memo (see due date below). If you decide to revise, take the instructors’ evaluation and recommendations with respect to form and substance into account and don’t make merely cosmetic or trivial changes. Your grade on the revision could be the same or even lower than your initial memo, but in any case the revised memo grade will replace the grade on your initial memo.
7. Schedule:

- Initial memo due: 8:00 a.m. Monday, June 26. Send file electronically to MP, DC, and MH.
- Initial memos discussed and evaluated: Memo Writing Workshop 3, 9-12 am, June 27. (Michelle Perez, instructor).
- Initial memos with grade and comments handed back: Policy I class, 5:00 p.m., Friday, June 30.
- (Optional) revision of memos due, 5:00 pm, Sunday, July 2 (Send electronically to DC and MH)
- Revised memos with grade and comments returned electronically by 5:00 p.m., Sunday, July 8.

## VI. Huaorani Asamblea

### HUAORANI ASAMBLEA: SETTING, ASSIGNMENT, AND CAST OF CHARACTERS

**Huaorani Asamblea:** (class, Wednesday, June 28)

**Setting the Scene:** Luis Macas, the president of CONAIE (Confederacion de las Nacionalidades Indigenas del Ecuador) has called a meeting of all the protagonists in the Oriente of Ecuador. The question on the table is how the ends and means of “good development” should be conceived and “operationalized” for the region as a whole and especially for the territory in which the Huaorani live, including Maxus Block 16, and for the Huaorani themselves. What are the available options? Which is best? Who should decide?

**Role Preferences and Group Formation.** Before the second class meeting, Thursday, June 15, select four roles you would be willing to play in the Asamblea. Your first two preferences should be the character with which you most closely identify and would like to play, and the third and fourth preferences should be the character with whom you feel the least sympathy but would still be willing to play. By Friday, June 9, 11 groups will be formed with 3 or 4 members in each group. These groups will work together not only for the Huaorani Asamblea but also for the Final Presentations July 27 and 28, although your final presentation may address a security rather than a development topic (see “Guidelines for Final Presentations”).

#### **Huaorani Asamblea Role:**

Each of the 11 speakers (each representing their team of three) should speak in character for 3-5 minutes. Then, Luis Macas will facilitate public deliberation about the best option and seek a reasonable consensus or, if necessary, a vote. Speakers, in character, may depart from their opening views in and through the give and take of argument in order to try to bring “concord from discord” or find a solution which most all can live with.

It will be up to your group to decide which of your group will make the presentation in the Huaorani Asamblea. But each member of the team is expected to do the research (no free riders!), help prepare the presentation, and be ready to participate in the general deliberation following the 10 presentations. Each person will be given a chance to contribute to the asamblea deliberations. In the deliberation (give and take) period, do not read “canned” speeches but critically respond to the proposals and arguments of others and give your own in response. Together seek a reasonable solution that most participants can accept.

#### **Huaorani Asamblea Research:**

In addition to reviewing *Savages*, you will want to consult the website for later Huaorani Updates from Joe Kane, many other items on the class web site, and the many other web sites, including the Huaorani’s own website ([www.onhae.org](http://www.onhae.org)). Remember, the book was published in 1996 (although the updates are more recent) and researched even earlier. Much has happened in the meantime (as the websites show), and it is up to you to be as up to date as possible. I urge you to be resourceful researchers and good detectives in using the net (google your character), telephone calls, and even interviews as you prepare for your roles and update us on the Huaorani. For example, after doing homework, the group playing Judith Kimerling (212-777-2135) may want to communicate with Judith Kimerling for her views on *Savages*, Joe Kane, and her current views on the best options for the Huaorani. One group tried unsuccessfully to talk to Robert Kennedy, Jr. (concerning his current views of the Huaorani and his past involvement). The team

representing an USAID spokesperson would want to talk to people at USAID working with Ecuador and any successor projects to SUBIR (referred to in *Savages*). What do representatives of the Embassy of Ecuador or current oil companies such as Petrobras now think of the Indigenous/Oil company conflict and what role the government might and should play? What is the current status of the Organization of American States (OAS) litigation case against the oil companies? (See description of roles for additional suggestions).

### **Presentations:**

Proposals should be directed to the entire Asamblea, although a given proposal may emphasize special responsibilities for one “stakeholder” (Moi’s village, the Huaorani, ONHAE, a Company, the government, OAS, IADB) Each proposal should identify the practical problem to be resolved and then clarify and assess at least two options and defend is the best option and what should be done to address the problem and by whom. Reasons may appeal to both values (ethical principles or criteria) and facts and be understandable to all participants. Following the 11 presentations, Luis Macas will facilitate a public discussion to deliberate the strengths and weaknesses of the various options and, if possible, decide by consensus or voting which is best. In this general discussion, all class members (still in role) are encouraged and will be given a chance to participate. The last portion of the time will be spent in a discussing the merits and demerits of the Asamblea as a method of social choice.

### **Timetable:**

- Role Presentations: 1 hour, 10 presentations, no more than 5 minutes each (yellow card after 4 minutes and red card after 5 minutes).
- Break: 15 minutes
- Deliberation and decision: 45 minutes
- Evaluation of Asamblea: 30 minutes

### **Cast of Characters for Huaorani Asamblea**

#### **1. Moi**

- (Former) Vice-President of ONHAE (and past president)
- Moi believes that Huaorani should appropriate parts of their past in order to cope and survive, but also is willing to use modern tools and ideas.
- “If we do not stop the Company the Huaorani will disappear forever”
- Led 1995 uprising (with Quichua) in against Maxus and skirmish with Ecuadorian military.
- Participated in negotiations with Company and testified in OAS in DC.
- What is he doing now?

#### **2. William Hutton**

- General Manager of Maxus in Ecuador
- Evangelical Baptist: sees Block 16 as opportunity for both oil and missionary conversion (and helping Huaorani adapt to change, Maxus style)

#### **3. Rachel Saint (her ghost and her son Steve)**

- Missionary (director of Summer Institute of Linguistics, charged by Government to be in charge of Protectorate and Huaorani health and education)
- Goal: civilize (change Huaorani practices and convert them to farming and market economy) and Christianize the Huaorani and convert the Tagaeri (138)

#### **4. Enqueri (El Condorito)**

- Plays “all the angles” but is also altruistic (92); good at adapting to “cowode” ways and opportunities (203)
- Takes on urban ways in dress and manners
- Became President of ONHAE and makes deal with Maxus: oil development in exchange for schools
- Most recently a missionary for Steve Saint

#### **5. Judith Kimerling**

- Former environmental litigator
- Author of Amazon Crude
- Set up legal aid programs in several Indian villages
- Believes the Huaorani have the legal (and moral?) right to live in a clean and safe environment (174) and survive in a way they judge best (right against ethnocide)
- Believes in and works for a multiethnic alliance of Indians, Ladinos, and Anglos (197, 201)
- Lives now in NYC (phone: 212-777-2135; email: [jkimerling@igc.org](mailto:jkimerling@igc.org))

#### **6. Ali Sharif**

- Iranian horticulturalist and practitioner of permaculture
- Against top-down and for grass-roots and sustainable development (108)
- Believes the “Company” will destroy the Huaorani because they can’t protect themselves (128)

#### **7. El Presidente of Ecuador**

- His predecessor (in the book) believed government needed outside oil investment and development for solving balance of payments and debt problems and knows that oil companies might go elsewhere if they are regulated
- Earlier government put Saint’s Institute and then Maxus in charge of Huaorani health and education

#### **8. Father Jose Miguel Goldaraz (El Capuchin)**

- Believes that change in the region is inevitable but the
- Huaorani can and should have the right to a say in deciding what sort of change.

#### **9. Valerio Grefa (El Vaselino)**

- Quichua President of CONFENIE (umbrella Indian organization)
- Tries to sabotage ONHAE
- Cooperates opportunistically (he would say, “realitically”) with oil companies

#### **10. Adriana Fabra**

- Spanish lawyer for Sierra Club Legal Defense Fund. Handled Huaorani petition to the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights of the Organization of American States.

#### **11. Randy Borman**

- Gringo/Cofan Leader (Insider/Outsider mix) of Cofans, who have been reduced to abject poverty (194) (after being banned from their forest home but got rights to another forest area and started indigenous ecotourism). (195)

**12. Representative of USAID (Sustainable Resource Development Program (SUBIR) or its successor)**

- Coordinated Yasuni Park Management Plan, one component of which was to incorporate the Huaorani into the management of the Park and the enforcement of the Yasuni Park Management Plan (funded by Maxus) – which included environmental monitoring of Maxus (232-330)

**13. Douglas McMeekin (not in book Savages but now an actor in the Amazon)**

- Former Conoco executive
- Now involved with the Yachana Lodge, one approach to “ecotourism.” (See website)

**14. Representative of Inter-American Development Bank**

- Advocates applying IADB’s poverty reduction strategy to the Ecuadorian Amazon
- Key contact: Carlos Viteri, a quichua employee in the “Sustainable Development” Unite of the IADB

**15. Robert Kennedy, Jr.**

- Worked with National Resources Defense Council
- Negotiated ill-fated plan with Ecuadorian government to protect Amazon and help the Huaorani

**16. James Leach or Carol Mahoney**

- Congresspeople supporting the Huaorani. See letter from US Congress.

**17. Alicia Cahuyia**

- Leader of new Huaorani women’s group AMWAE (see [www.onhae.org/yasuni/indigenous/documents/5.18.05](http://www.onhae.org/yasuni/indigenous/documents/5.18.05))

**18. Another character from the book or one you invent**

- E.g., Carl Ros, Director of Save the Forest; official from Ecuadorian Embassy